

## APPENDIX A

### DERIVATION OF THE ERROR BOUND

To reduce the error  $\Delta\hat{L}$ , our method aims to select the triplet with the maximum standard deviation. The standard deviation  $\sigma_j$  for the  $j$ -th triplet is calculated from (the arguments are omitted for simplicity):

$$\sigma_j = \sqrt{\text{Var}[\hat{L}_j]} = \frac{A_j W_j I_j}{\sqrt{n_j}} \sqrt{\text{Var}[R_d H]}.$$

Since the computation of the variance of  $R_d H$  involves costly evaluations of  $R_d H$  over all VPLs, irradiance points, and shading points in the triplet  $(\mathbb{C}_j^L, \mathbb{C}_j^I, \mathbb{C}_j^S)$ , and the standard deviation is just used to select the triplet with (possibly) a large error, our method approximates the standard deviation using the upper bounds of the diffuse BSSRDF  $R_d^u$ , the geometry term  $G^u$ , and the Fresnel transmittance  $F_t^u$  as follows:

$$\sigma_j = \frac{A_j W_j I_j}{\sqrt{n_j}} \sqrt{\text{Var}[R_d G V F_t]} \approx \frac{A_j W_j I_j}{\sqrt{n_j}} R_d^u G^u F_t^u \sqrt{\text{Var}[V]}.$$

The standard deviation of the visibility function,  $\sqrt{\text{Var}[V]}$ , is bounded by the maximum value 0.5 [1]. By substituting this, the error bound  $e_j$  is derived.

#### A.1 The geometry term $G$ and the upper bounds $G^u$ and $F_t^u$

The geometry term  $G(\mathbf{y}, \mathbf{x}_i)$  between the VPL  $\mathbf{y}$  and the irradiance point  $\mathbf{x}_i$  is calculated as:

$$G(\mathbf{y}, \mathbf{x}_i) = \frac{\max(\cos \theta_{\mathbf{y}}, 0) \max(\cos \theta_{\mathbf{x}_i}, 0)}{\|\mathbf{y} - \mathbf{x}_i\|^2},$$

where  $\theta_{\mathbf{y}}$  is the angle between the normal at  $\mathbf{y}$  and  $-\omega_{\mathbf{y}\mathbf{x}_i}$ , and  $\theta_{\mathbf{x}_i}$  is that between the normal  $\mathbf{n}_i$  at  $\mathbf{x}_i$  and  $\omega_{\mathbf{y}\mathbf{x}_i}$ .

The upper bound  $G^u$  of the geometry term between IC  $\mathbb{C}_j^I$  and LC  $\mathbb{C}_j^L$  is calculated in the same way as Multidimensional Lightcuts [2]. Since the computation of the upper bound  $G^u$  involves computation of the upper bound of  $\cos \theta_{\mathbf{x}_i}$  (i.e., the lower bound of  $\theta_{\mathbf{x}_i}$ ), and the Fresnel transmittance  $F_t$  decreases monotonically<sup>1</sup> with respect to the angle  $\theta_{\mathbf{x}_i}$ , the upper bound  $F_t^u$  between  $\mathbb{C}_j^I$  and  $\mathbb{C}_j^L$  is easily computed using the lower bound of  $\theta_{\mathbf{x}_i}$ .

#### A.2 The diffuse BSSRDF $R_d(r)$ and its upper bound $R_d^u$

The diffuse BSSRDF  $R_d(r)$  is represented by the following equation [6]:

$$\frac{\alpha'}{4\pi} \left[ z_r \left( (1 + \sigma_{tr} d_r) \frac{e^{-\sigma_{tr} d_r}}{d_r^3} \right) + z_v \left( (1 + \sigma_{tr} d_v) \frac{e^{-\sigma_{tr} d_v}}{d_v^3} \right) \right],$$

$$d_r = \sqrt{r^2 + z_r^2}, d_v = \sqrt{r^2 + z_v^2}, z_r = \frac{1}{\sigma'_t}, z_v = z_r \left( 1 + \frac{4}{3} \mathcal{A} \right),$$

$$\sigma_{tr} = \sqrt{3\sigma_a \sigma'_t}, \sigma'_t = \sigma'_s + \sigma_a, \sigma'_s = \sigma_s (1 - g), \alpha' = \frac{\sigma'_s}{\sigma'_t}$$

where  $\sigma_a$ ,  $\sigma_s$ , and  $\sigma_t$  are absorption, scattering, and extinction coefficients for a translucent material,  $\sigma'_s$  and  $\sigma'_t$  are reduced scattering and extinction coefficients,  $g$  is the mean

cosine of the scattering angle,  $\sigma_{tr}$  is the effective extinction coefficient,  $\mathcal{A}$  is calculated by the diffuse Fresnel reflectance.

The diffuse BSSRDF  $R_d(r)$  is also a monotonically decreasing function with respect to the distance  $r$  between an irradiance point and a shading point. As such, the upper bound  $R_d^u$  is calculated from the minimum distance between the bounding boxes of IC  $\mathbb{C}_j^I$  and SC  $\mathbb{C}_j^S$ .

1. Strictly speaking,  $F_t$  decreases monotonically when the relative refractive index  $\eta$  satisfies  $\eta \in [2 - \sqrt{3}, 2 + \sqrt{3}]$  [3], and  $\eta$  for translucent materials used in our method satisfies this condition.

## REFERENCES

- [1] K. Nabata, K. Iwasaki, Y. Dobashi, and T. Nishita, "An error estimation framework for many-light rendering," *Computer Graphics Forum*, vol. 35, no. 7, pp. 431–439, 2016.
- [2] B. Walter, A. Arbre, K. Bala, and D. P. Greenberg, "Multidimensional lightcuts," *ACM Transactions on Graphics*, vol. 25, no. 3, pp. 1081–1088, 2006.
- [3] Y. Tokuyoshi and T. Harada, "Stochastic light culling for VPLs on GGX microsurfaces," *Computer Graphics Forum*, vol. 36, no. 4, pp. 55–63, 2017.